



Writing a Comment

Exercise 33

В упражнении использовано задание финала РАНХиГС 2022/23, 10–11 класс

Explain what is wrong with the reasoning below. Write not less than 5 words and not more than 25 words.

Example:

ANNA: My uncle says that Bobby Y. Red was a good, honest man.

TONY: Doesn't your uncle come from the North? I don't think we need to give much weight to your uncle's arguments if he is from the North. He's obviously biased.

Your explanation: *Anna's uncle may be biased, but Tony shouldn't totally disregard his opinion because of that. A person's character or motives may influence his arguments, but these things don't necessarily have any bearing on the strength of his arguments.*

1. This new book must be extremely interesting. It has been on the best-seller list for months.

2. MOTHER: I think you have been playing too many of those video games lately.

SON: Oh, so you think I should just throw away my \$1,000 video game collection and sit up in my room taking practice IQ tests all day?

3. PLAINTIFF: Judge, I'm not lying. I'm a religious person, and religious people don't lie.

JUDGE: How do I know you are a religious person?

PLAINTIFF: Because I would never lie.

4. "If the English don't drive on the right side of the road, what are they doing on the wrong side?"

5. MOTHER: We can't let her get another dog!

FATHER: Oh, we can handle two dogs in the house. She loves animals. MOTHER: Two dogs? She'll ask for three or four next. This isn't going to stop!

Key

1 This new book must be extremely interesting. It has been on the best-seller list for months.

Answer: The argument is irrelevant. The most popular book isn't necessarily the best book.

2 MOTHER: I think you have been playing too many of those video games lately.

SON: Oh, so you think I should just throw away my \$1,000 video game collection and sit up in my room taking practice IQ tests all day?

Answer: The argument is irrelevant. This is not what the mother said. The son is exaggerating his mother's viewpoint. She thought he should play fewer video games - not no video games at all.

3 PLAINTIFF: Judge, I'm not lying. I'm a religious person, and religious people don't lie.

JUDGE: How do I know you are a religious person?

PLAINTIFF: Because I would never lie.

Answer: The argument is irrelevant. The plaintiff is using circular reasoning. The plaintiff is saying that he is a religious person, and since religious people don't lie, he isn't lying. We have to assume that he isn't lying when he says he is a religious person! The plaintiff is going in circles.

4 *“If the English don't drive on the right side of the road, what are they doing on the wrong side?”*

Answer: The argument is irrelevant. The speaker changes the meaning of a word in the middle of an argument. Here, “right” changes meaning from right-hand versus left-hand, to right versus wrong.

5 *MOTHER: We can't let her get another dog!*

FATHER: Oh, we can handle two dogs in the house. She loves animals.

MOTHER: Two dogs? She'll ask for three or four next. This isn't going to stop!

Answer: The argument is irrelevant. It is assumed there is no line between adding one dog to the house and adding two or three dogs. But one dog and three dogs are different.